

## **critique of the Persian translation of Zahran Alqasmi's novel Tughreebat al-Qaafir based on Carmen Garcés theory**

Zeinab Moslempour Khazineh (corresponding author): M.A. Student of Arabic Translation Studies,  
Faculty of Theology and Islamic Studies, Shahid Chamran  
University of Ahvaz, Ahvaz, Iran.

Email: [zeinabmoslempoor@gmail.com](mailto:zeinabmoslempoor@gmail.com)

Rasoul Balavi (Corresponding Author), Professor of Arabic Language and Literature, Faculty of  
Theology and Islamic Studies, Shahid Chamran University of Ahvaz, Ahvaz, Iran.  
Seyyed Ahmad Mosawi Panah, Assistant Professor of Arabic Language and Literature, Faculty of  
Theology and Islamic Studies, Shahid Chamran University of Ahvaz, Ahvaz, Iran.

### **Introduction**

Literature, in the sense of the art of speaking or artistic expression, is distinguished from ordinary speech by the way the author reveals inner emotions and hidden thoughts, introducing the reader to imaginative experiences and emotional states. Through a mysterious and symbolic style, employing imagination and emotional depth, the author explores the complexities of the human psyche and immortalizes feelings in diverse forms. In this regard, understanding the author's expression in a literary text and conveying it into another language for readers unfamiliar with the source language appears to be a highly challenging and complex task. Among various types of translation, literary translation is recognized as the most difficult and precise.

Studying and analyzing others' translations is a fundamental element in learning, developing talent, and gaining experience and skills (Jabouri et al., 1977, p. 431). In the translation process, issues such as semantic expansion or reduction, preservation of meaning, and textual modifications often arise. These issues may result from either the strengths of the translation or its weaknesses and shortcomings. To assess the functional or non-functional aspects of these issues, the translated text must be examined from the perspective of different models. Frequently, progress in this field, within the framework of linguistic knowledge, cannot be achieved without careful analysis and critique of translations. Therefore, it is necessary to conduct translation work systematically and methodically to improve its quality.

One of the most prominent frameworks proposed by theorists and translation studies specialists is Carmen Valero Garcés' model (1994). Garcés suggests four analytical levels for evaluating translations in order to compare the similarities between source and target texts, which may sometimes overlap. The present study, employing a descriptive-analytical method, compares portions of the original text of the novel *Taghribat al-Qafir* by Zahran Al-Qasimi with its translation *The Amazing Soothsayer* by Masoumeh Tamimi, based on the principles and criteria of Garcés' model. The source and target texts are examined and evaluated using two of the four levels—semantic-lexical and syntactic-morphological—to assess the degree of correspondence between the translation and the original text.

### **Methodology**

Garcés' (۱۹۹۴) theory provides a comprehensive framework for evaluating literary texts, going beyond the mere meaning of words and sentences and considering four distinct analytical levels. This model is recognized as one of the most prominent approaches in the field of literary translation criticism, and its increasing application by researchers in recent years attests to its distinguished and valued position among translation critics. The present study employs a

qualitative approach to analyze and evaluate the Persian translation of the novel *Taghribat al-Qafir*, titled *The Amazing Soothsayer*, based on Garcés' model, focusing specifically on two levels: the semantic-lexical and the syntactic-morphological levels.

## **Results and Discussion**

This study applied Carmen Garcés' translation evaluation model to examine the Omani novel *Taghribat al-Qafir* by Zahran Al-Qasimi and its Persian translation, *The Amazing Soothsayer*, by Masoumeh Tamimi. The analysis focused on two levels of Garcés' four-level model: semantic-lexical and syntactic-morphological.

At the semantic-lexical level, key features included cultural or functional equivalents, syntactic expansion and compression, specificity versus generality, and ambiguity. At the syntactic-morphological level, the translator employed strategies such as literal translation, adaptation, structural changes, perspective shifts, explanation or expansion, reduction and deletion, and sentence type modification, successfully conveying the intended meaning.

Regarding the effectiveness of these strategies, the analysis shows that positive features outweigh negative ones. Thus, the translation demonstrates both adequacy and acceptability according to Garcés' model, reflecting a satisfactory performance at the semantic-lexical and syntactic-morphological levels.

## **Conclusion**

This study applied Carmen Garcés' translation evaluation model to examine the Omani novel *Taghribat al-Qafir* by Zahran Al-Qasimi and its Persian translation, *The Amazing Soothsayer*, by Masoumeh Tamimi. The analysis focused on two levels of Garcés' four-level model: semantic-lexical and syntactic-morphological.

At the semantic-lexical level, key features included cultural or functional equivalents, syntactic expansion and compression, specificity versus generality, and ambiguity. At the syntactic-morphological level, the translator employed strategies such as literal translation, adaptation, structural changes, perspective shifts, explanation or expansion, reduction and deletion, and sentence type modification, successfully conveying the intended meaning.

Regarding the effectiveness of these strategies, the analysis shows that positive features outweigh negative ones. Thus, the translation demonstrates both adequacy and acceptability according to Garcés' model, reflecting a satisfactory performance at the semantic-lexical and syntactic-morphological levels.

## **References**

- Azarnoush, A. (2017). *Contemporary Arabic–Persian dictionary*. Tehran: Nashr-e Ney. {In Persian }
- Al-Qasimi, Z. (2022). *Taghribat al-Qafir*. Tunis: Dar Rashm for Publishing and Distribution. {In Arabic }
- Al-Jasim, A. (2018). *Naqd al-tarjama: al-mafahim wa al-manahij*. Beirut: Dar al-Fikr al-Arabi. {In Arabic }
- Al-Husni, N. (2019). *Athar al-nazariyah al-nasqiyah fi naqd al-tarjama al-adabiyah*. *Majallat Adab al-Farahidi*, 11(42), 95–120. {In Arabic }

- Al-Shenawi, S. (2017). Al-tarjama al-adabiyah bayn al-amanah wa al-ibda': Muqarabah naqdiyah fi dhaw' nazariyat Garcés. *Majallat al-Lisaniyat wa al-Tarjama*, 3(6), 44–70. {In Arabic}
- Farhadi, P. (2013). Study of criticism and translation of contemporary texts: A case study on the critique and evaluation of Ghassan Kanafani's translated works in stories, narratives, and plays (Master's thesis). University of Tehran, Faculty of Literature and Humanities. {In Persian}
- Garaji, Z., & Rostampour Maleki, R. (2021). Critique of selected Persian translations of Gibran's works in Hammam-e Ruh based on Garcés' theoretical model. *Journal of Translation Studies in Arabic Language and Literature*, 11(24), 145–182. {In Persian}
- Haqani, N. (2020). Theories and approaches in translation (3rd ed.). Tehran: } In Persian. {Azin Publishing
- Kabiri, M., Hashmati, B., & Tand, B. (2022). Comparison of the Arabic and Persian translation structure of *The Prophet* by Khalil Gibran based on Carmen Garcés' model. *Journal of Translation Studies in Arabic Language and Literature*, 12(27), 37–67. {In Persian}
- Khanjan, A. (2021). Critical analysis of translation (1st ed.). Tehran: Agah Publishing {In Persian}
- Moteqi Zadeh, E., & Naqi Zadeh, S. A. (2017). Evaluation of Persian-to-Arabic literary texts based on Carmen Garcés' model (A case study: The Leader's message on the occasion of Hajj 2016). *Journal of Translation Studies in Arabic Language and Literature*, 7(16), 169–193. {In Persian}
- Niazi, Sh., & Ghasemi Asl, Z. (2018). Translation evaluation models (with a focus on Arabic language). Tehran: University of Tehran Press. {In Persian}
- Rashidi, N., & Farzaneh, S. (2010). Evaluation and comparison of Persian translations of the English novel *The Prince and the Pauper* by Mark Twain based on Garcés' model (1994). *Zaban Pazhouhi-e Alzahra University*, 2(3), 57–105. {In Persian}
- Sowari, F., & Amouri, N. (2024). Evaluation of the Persian translation of the novel *Fi Qalbi Untha 'ibriya* based on Carmen Garcés' model. *Journal of Translation Studies in Arabic Language and Literature*, 14(30), 263–298. {In Persian}
- Shamsabadi, H., & Afzali, F. (2013). Methods of structural, lexical, and contextual equivalence in story translation from Arabic into Persian (based on selected stories by Naguib Mahfouz). *Journal of Translation Studies in Arabic Language and Literature*, 3(6), 29–48. {In Persian}
- Shiri, A., & Hadavi Khalilabad, Z. (2020). Critique of the translation of the novel *Frankenstein* in Baghdad by Ahmed Saadawi based on Garcés' theory. *Journal of Translation Studies in Arabic Language and Literature*, 10(23), 271–304. {In Persian}
- Tamimi, M. (2023). *Taghribat al-Qafir* [Persian translation]. Tehran: Nashr-e Ebarat. {In Persian}
- Zarkoub, M. (2019). A modern approach to translation techniques (Arabic–Persian / Persian–Arabic). Isfahan: Mani Publishing. {In Persian}